

**Court of Appeals, Division One**  
**Civil-Election Appeal-ARCAP 8.1**

**1 CA-CV 24-0387 EL**

**ROUNDTREE et al. v. PAGE**

**Appellate Case Information**

Case Filed: 28-May-2024  
 Case Closed:

**Dept/Composition**

**Department C**  
 Hon. Paul J McMurdie  
 Hon. Maria Elena Cruz  
 Hon. Cynthia J Bailey

**Side 1. DEBRA ROUNDTREE, an individual; STEVEN KIDMAN, an individual; PAGE ACTION COMMITTEE, a registered political committee, Plaintiff/Appellant**

**(Litigant Group) ROUNDTREE et al.**

- Debra Roundtree
- Steven Kidman
- Page Action Committee

**Attorneys for: Plaintiffs/Appellants**

James E Barton, II, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 23888)  
 Jacqueline Mendez Soto, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 22597)  
 Daniella Fernandez Lertzman, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 37943)

**Side 2. CITY OF PAGE, a political subdivision of the state of Arizona; KARY HOLLOWAY, in her official capacity as City Clerk; KIM LARSON, in her official capacity as Acting Deputy City Clerk., Defendant/Appellee**

**(Litigant Group) PAGE**

- City of Page
- Kary Holloway
- Kim Larson

**Attorneys for: Defendants/Appellees**

Anna Christina Estes-Werther, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 25075)  
 Jon M Paladini, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 15230)  
 Matt Schiumo, Esq. (AZ Bar No. 38751)

**CASE STATUS**

Jul 5, 2024.....Pending in ASC

PREDECESSOR CASE (S)	Cause/Charge/Class	Judgment/Sentence	Judge, Role <Comments>	Trial	Dispo
CON S0300CV202400227			Cathleen Brown Nichols, Authoring Judge of Order		

**DESCENDENT CASE (S)**

ASC CV-24-0144-PR

**CASE DECISION**

02-Jul-2024 **MEMORANDUM DECISION**

Maria Cruz.....Author  
 Paul McMurdie.....Concur  
 Cynthia Bailey.....Concur

Filed: 02-Jul-2024 Mandate:

Decision Disposition
<b><i>Affirmed</i></b>

**15 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

1. 28-May-2024 FILED: Statement Identifying Appeal as Expedited Election Matter and Request for Initial Telephonic Conference; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
2. 28-May-2024 FILED: Appellate Clerk Notice re: No Appellee Fee Due
3. 29-May-2024 FILED: Notice of Lodging the Coconino Superior Court Clerk's File-Stamped Dated Filings Submitted to this Court for Plaintiffs/Appellants' Exhibits to their Statement Identifying Appeal as Expedited Election Matter and Request for Initial Telephonic Scheduling Conference Filed on May 28, 2024 for the Record; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
4. 30-May-2024 FILED: e-Record on Appeal: Instruments/Minute Entries Exhibits: Hearing Date 4/8/24 A, B, C, D, E F Hearing Date 4/17/24 A, B, C
5. 30-May-2024 FILED: Index of Record, Notice of Appeal from Coconino County Superior Court filed 5/27/24
6. 30-May-2024 (ORDERED:) During the scheduling conference, parties discussed and agreed to following information (see order). Simultaneous briefs due 06/13/2024 by 5:00 p.m. Hon Paul J McMurdie - Author

**Court of Appeals, Division One**  
**Civil-Election Appeal-ARCAP 8.1**

**1 CA-CV 24-0387 EL**

**ROUNDTREE et al. v. PAGE**

**15 PROCEEDING ENTRIES**

7. 31-May-2024 RECEIPT No.: 2024-00526 ; \$280.00, Authorization: #52008126128, Applied to: ROUNDTREE et al. - Class A Filing Fee (\$280.00) Paid for: Barton Mendez Soto PLLC - By nCourt LLC
8. 31-May-2024 AMENDED (ORDER:) During the scheduling conference, parties discussed and agreed to following information (see order). Simultaneous briefs due 06/13/2024 by 5:00 p.m. Hon Paul J McMurdie - Author
9. 13-Jun-2024 FILED: Appellants Opening Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellant)
10. 13-Jun-2024 FILED: Appellees [sic] Brief; Certificate of Compliance; Certificate of Service (Appellee)
11. 2-Jul-2024 MEMORANDUM DECISION (Affirmed) Hon Maria Elena Cruz - Author; Hon Paul J McMurdie - Concur; Hon Cynthia J Bailey - Concur
12. 3-Jul-2024 FILED: Decision Distribution Notification
13. 3-Jul-2024 FILED: Supplemented Superior Court e-Record with Revised Index of Record
14. 5-Jul-2024 FILED: Email Notice from ASC re: Petition for Review filed 07/05/24; request for partial record
15. 5-Jul-2024 FILED: Letter forwarding partial record to Arizona Supreme Court